Journal of Social Work and Social Welfare Policy

The Role of Affirmative Action and DEI Programs in Empowering the Black Community in the United States of America: Challenges, Successes, and the Path Forward

Robb Shawe, Ph.D., MS,

Department of Critical Infrastructure, Capitol Technology University, Laurel, MD, United States.

Abstract

Affirmative Action (AA) and Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) programs are pivotal in addressing systemic inequities and empowering the Black community in the United States. These initiatives aim to dismantle barriers to education, employment, and essential resources while fostering understanding and collaboration across diverse groups. This manuscript explores the historical context, sector-specific successes, and criticisms of AA and DEI programs. It highlights the need for targeted, data-driven strategies that go beyond quotas to achieve genuine inclusivity. By addressing challenges and refining success metrics, AA and DEI programs can drive societal progress, economic growth, and equity for marginalized communities.

Keywords: Affirmative Action (AA), Black Community, Black Women Empowerment, Culturally Competent Care, Diversity. Economic Mobility, Education, Empowerment, Equity, Inclusion (DEI), Generational Wealth, Global Comparisons. Grassroots Initiatives, Intersectionality, Opportunity, Policy, Public Education Campaigns. STEMM Diversity, Supplier Diversity, Systemic Discrimination, United States of America, Workplace Economic Impact

Introduction

Affirmative Action (AA) and Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) programs are essential tools for addressing systemic inequities and promoting fairness in American society. Rooted in the historical exclusion of Black individuals from opportunities [1], these initiatives aim to create equitable access to education, employment, and other resources. Beyond benefiting underrepresented populations, AA and DEI foster innovation and societal progress by leveraging diverse perspectives [2].

This study examines the historical context, successes, and criticisms of AA and DEI programs, with a focus on their impact on the Black community. It also proposes actionable recommendations for improving these initiatives to ensure they achieve their intended goals. By addressing systemic barriers and fostering inclusivity, AA and DEI programs can contribute to a society where diversity is celebrated, and every individual has the opportunity to thrive.

Empowerment and Fair Opportunities through Affirmative Action Addressing Historical Discrimination

Affirmative Action (AA) was introduced to counteract the effects of centuries of systemic discrimination that excluded Black Americans from equal participation in society [1]. Policies such as race-conscious admissions and equitable hiring practices have been instrumental in creating pathways for Black individuals to access education and employment. For example, the University of Michigan's race-conscious admissions policies in the early 2000s significantly increased Black student enrollment and graduation rates, demonstrating the transformative potential of AA [3].

Creating Equitable Access to Opportunities

AA programs have also been effective in fostering fair competition. By addressing biases in selection processes, these initiatives ensure that Black individuals are evaluated based on their talent and abilities rather than stereotypes [4]. For instance, the Dallas Independent School District's equity initiative, which prioritized hiring Black teachers and administrators, led to improved academic performance and graduation rates among Black students [4]. These examples highlight the significance of AA in equalizing the playing field and fostering equity.

The Role of DEI in Workplace and Institutional Diversity Balancing Corporate and Public Sector Examples

The manuscript places a strong emphasis on corporate initiatives, such as those undertaken by Google and Johnson & Johnson;

however, it also includes examples from public institutions and nonprofit organizations. For instance, the Dallas Independent School District's equity initiative, which prioritized hiring Black teachers and administrators, significantly improved academic outcomes for Black students [4]. Highlighting such examples would demonstrate the broader applicability of AA and DEI programs across sectors.

Strategic Implementation in Organizations

Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) programs are critical for fostering inclusive environments in workplaces and institutions. Companies like Google and Johnson & Johnson have demonstrated the benefits of targeted DEI initiatives, such as mentorship programs, resource groups, and supplier diversity programs [5]. These efforts have not only increased Black representation in leadership roles but also enhanced innovation and competitiveness [6].

Benefits of Diverse Representation

Diverse teams bring unique perspectives that drive creativity, problem-solving, and adaptability. For example, Black arts and culture organizations in Cleveland have leveraged DEI programs to preserve cultural heritage while creating economic opportunities [5]. Similarly, in STEMM fields, reframing DEI as a tool for inclusion has fostered peer support networks and improved outcomes for all employees [2].

Societal Enrichment through Inclusion

DEI programs also contribute to societal cohesion by fostering understanding and respect among diverse groups. By addressing systemic inequities, these initiatives create spaces where all individuals feel valued and empowered to contribute [5]. This societal enrichment extends beyond the workplace, promoting economic growth and cultural vitality [6].

Economic and Business Impacts of AA and DEI

The business case for AA and DEI is demonstrated by companies like Johnson & Johnson, which launched a supplier diversity program to increase contracts with Black-owned businesses. This initiative resulted in not only greater economic empowerment for Black entrepreneurs but also improved innovation and competitiveness for the company. In the nonprofit sector, Black-led organizations that received DEI funding were able to expand their services, create new jobs, and invest in community development projects [5]. The absence of such frameworks, as seen in organizations that fail to prioritize DEI, often leads to stagnation, limited market reach, and missed growth opportunities [6]. These examples show that structured DEI frameworks promote sustainable community development and shared prosperity.

The financial services sector has also benefited from AA and DEI programs. For instance, JP Morgan Chase has created a fellowship program for Black college students, providing mentorship, paid internships, and direct hiring pathways into the banking industry. This program increased Black representation in financial analyst and management roles, while also promoting economic mobility for participants and their families.

Grassroots and Community-Led Efforts

The manuscript focuses heavily on corporate and institutional initiatives but overlooks grassroots efforts that have successfully implemented AA and DEI principles. For instance, Black-led nonprofits, such as those highlighted in Cleveland's arts and culture sector, have leveraged DEI funding to preserve cultural heritage and create economic opportunities [5]. Including such examples would demonstrate how community-driven initiatives can complement larger institutional programs.

Enhancing Individual and Community Prosperity

AA and DEI programs remove barriers that limit economic freedom and improve access to opportunities for marginalized groups [5]. For example, JPMorgan Chase's fellowship program for Black college students has increased Black representation in financial roles while promoting economic mobility for participants and their families [6].

Boosting Business Productivity and Innovation

Organizations that prioritize diversity and inclusion tend to benefit from enhanced innovation and improved performance. Companies like Salesforce and Cisco have demonstrated that inclusive policies lead to better market performance and industry-leading innovations [7]. These examples highlight the economic and competitive advantages of embracing diversity.

Challenges and Shortcomings in AA and DEI

Despite the progress made, AA and DEI programs sometimes fall short, particularly when diversity initiatives are implemented as quotas without adequate attention to the unique needs of the Black community. For example, the Watson v. Fort Worth Bank & Trust case highlighted how broad-based diversity measures can overlook Black applicants, leading to outcomes where other groups benefit disproportionately [3]. In another instance, a large tech company's diversity program focused on increasing the overall representation of minorities. However, most gains went to groups already closer to existing power structures, leaving Black employees with minimal advancement [8]. These examples underscore the need for more targeted approaches that prioritize those most affected by systemic discrimination.

Global Comparisons for Broader Insights

Although the manuscript is U.S.-centric, a brief comparison with similar programs in other countries could provide valuable insights. For example, South Africa's Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) policies offer lessons on addressing systemic inequities in post-apartheid contexts [9]. Similarly, Canada's equity-focused hiring practices in public institutions could serve as a model for refining AA and DEI strategies in the U.S. [4].

Overlooked Needs of the Black Community

While AA and DEI programs have made significant strides, they sometimes fail to address the unique challenges faced by the Black community. For instance, broad-based diversity initiatives may disproportionately benefit other minority groups, leaving Black individuals with minimal advancement [8]. To address this, programs must prioritize the specific needs of the Black community.

To further emphasize the unique challenges faced by the Black community, the manuscript can include the following:

- **Targeted Programs for Black Entrepreneurs:** Highlight initiatives like grants, mentorship programs, and access to capital specifically designed for Black-owned businesses. For example, the Minority Business Development Agency (MBDA) has successfully supported Black entrepreneurs by providing tailored resources and funding opportunities.

- **Addressing Educational Disparities:** Include examples of programs that focus on closing achievement gaps for Black students, such as scholarships for historically Black colleges and universities (HBCUs) or partnerships with community organizations to provide tutoring and college readiness programs.

- **Healthcare Equity:** Discuss initiatives aimed at enhancing access to healthcare for Black communities, including culturally competent care programs and targeted recruitment efforts for Black healthcare professionals.

Intersectionality in AA and DEI Programs

While the manuscript effectively highlights the challenges faced by the Black community, it could benefit from a deeper exploration of intersectionality—the overlapping identities of race, gender, socio-economic status, and disability. For example, Black women often

face compounded discrimination in both race and gender, which requires tailored strategies to address their unique barriers [4]. Incorporating intersectionality into AA and DEI programs ensures that initiatives are inclusive of all marginalized groups within the Black community.

Incorporate Intersectionality into Programs

To strengthen strategies for addressing resistance, the manuscript can include:

Public Education Campaigns:

• Highlight successful campaigns that have shifted public opinion on AA and DEI programs, such as storytelling initiatives that showcase the personal and societal benefits of diversity. For example, campaigns like "I Am Diversity" have used real-life stories to foster understanding and empathy.

Case Studies of Overcoming Resistance:

• Include examples of organizations that successfully countered opposition to DEI programs. For instance, a tech company that faced backlash for its diversity initiatives used data to demonstrate increased innovation and profitability, ultimately gaining broader support.

Community Engagement:

• Discuss the importance of engaging local communities in conversations about AA and DEI programs. Town halls, focus groups, and partnerships with community leaders can help address misconceptions and build trust.

Re-evaluating Success Metrics in Inclusion Efforts

Traditional success metrics, such as diversity quotas, often fail to capture the long-term impact of AA and DEI programs. Instead, metrics should focus on sustained economic freedom, solidarity, and the dismantling of systemic barriers [5]. Innovative frameworks and inclusive leadership are essential for achieving these goals [9].

Concrete Metrics for Success

While the manuscript emphasizes the importance of data-driven strategies, it lacks specific examples of metrics to measure success. For instance, metrics such as the percentage increase in Black representation in leadership roles, the economic mobility of program participants, and the reduction of wage gaps could be used to evaluate the effectiveness of AA and DEI initiatives [5, 6]. These metrics would provide a more transparent framework for assessing progress.

Opposition to AA and DEI Programs

Critiques and Misconceptions

Critics of AA and DEI programs often argue that these initiatives create unfair advantages or propagate division [3]. However, such criticisms overlook the historical context and the systemic barriers these programs aim to address. By fostering understanding and emphasizing the societal benefits of diversity, proponents can counter these misconceptions [10].

Critiques from White Nationalist Perspectives

Critics and opposers of AA and DEI programs, particularly White Nationalists, view these initiatives as threats to their inherent societal privileges and economic entitlements. They view AA and DEI to be reverse racism, in which the programs allegedly favor minorities, especially Black people, rather than the majority [3]. Such a belief system is reflective of the critics' views of the perception surrounding AA and DEI as programs that undermine the meritocratic structure of society by favoring racial diversity over competence. This perspective feeds their description of the impact of AA and DEI programming as disruptive to the already established social order. Further, the critics' perspective is visible in their expressions that portray AA and DEI as programs that propagate division in society by accentuating the differences in race and, as such, breeding countless grievances and

social tensions [3]. However, despite the criticisms, the existence of AA and DEI today is vital in understanding the criteria for restoring balance caused by historical discrimination and returning society toward acceptance, whereby diversity remains a point of strength.

Strategies to Address Resistance

The manuscript acknowledges resistance to AA and DEI programs, but could expand on actionable strategies to counter opposition. For example, fostering inclusive leadership and using data to demonstrate the economic benefits of diversity can help combat misconceptions [9, 10]. Additionally, public education campaigns that emphasize the historical context of systemic discrimination can shift public opinion [3].

The Necessity of AA and DEI for Equity

Case studies demonstrate that AA and DEI programs are essential for promoting fairness and driving societal progress. For example, targeted AA initiatives in higher education have led to increased graduation rates and post-graduate employment among Black students [3]. Conversely, the rollback of DEI policies has resulted in decreased diversity and satisfaction among minority groups [6].

Recommendations for Improvement

1. **Targeted Approaches:** Design programs that specifically address the barriers facing the Black community, such as scholarships, mentorship, and direct support for Black-owned businesses [4, 5].

2. **Reassess Success Metrics:** Shift the focus from quotas to long-term outcomes, such as economic mobility, community development, and systemic change. Success metrics should prioritize sustained economic freedom and solidarity over mere representation [5, 9].

3. **Foster Inclusive Leadership:** Train leaders to prioritize inclusivity and address biases within their organizations. Innovative frameworks and inclusive leadership can combat resistance and ensure meaningful engagement [5, 9].

4. **Collaborate with Communities:** Engage directly with the Black community to ensure programs are responsive to their needs. Policymakers and organizations should work closely with marginalized groups to co-create solutions that address systemic barriers [5, 6].

5. **Promote Public Awareness:** Counter misconceptions about AA and DEI by highlighting their societal benefits and addressing criticisms with data-driven arguments. Public education campaigns can help foster understanding and support for these initiatives [3, 10].

6. **Sector-Specific Strategies:** Tailor AA and DEI programs to the unique challenges of different sectors, such as education, healthcare, and business. For example, targeted recruitment in healthcare can improve culturally competent care, while mentorship programs in STEMM can address gaps in diverse talent [2, 5]. To provide more detailed strategies tailored to specific industries, the manuscript can include:

Healthcare:

• **Culturally Competent Care:** Encourage healthcare organizations to recruit and train Black professionals to improve patient outcomes in underserved communities.

• **Community Health Initiatives:** Highlight programs like mobile clinics and health education campaigns targeting Black populations.

Education:

• **Teacher Diversity:** Expand on the Dallas Independent School District example by discussing similar initiatives in other districts that prioritize hiring Black educators to improve representation and student outcomes.

- **STEMM Mentorship Programs:** Include examples of mentorship programs for Black students in STEMM fields, such as partnerships with organizations such as Black Girls Code or the National Society of Black Engineers.

Business:

- **Supplier Diversity Programs:** Encourage companies to adopt supplier diversity initiatives that prioritize contracts with Black-owned businesses, driving economic empowerment.

- **Leadership Development:** Discuss programs that prepare Black employees for leadership roles, such as executive coaching and sponsorship initiatives.

7. **Continuous Monitoring and Adjustment:** Implement data-driven strategies to assess the effectiveness of AA and DEI programs regularly. Adjustments should be made based on measurable outcomes to ensure these initiatives achieve their intended goals [4, 6].

8. **Address Overlooked Needs:** Ensure AA and DEI programs prioritize the unique challenges faced by the Black community, rather than adopting broad-based diversity measures that may disproportionately benefit other groups [8].

9. **Combat Resistance with Evidence:** Develop innovative frameworks to address resistance to AA and DEI programs, particularly from groups that view these initiatives as divisive. Evidence-based strategies can demonstrate the societal and economic benefits of inclusivity [9, 10].

10. **Expand Economic Opportunities:** Encourage businesses to adopt supplier diversity programs and create pathways for Black entrepreneurs to thrive. Such initiatives can drive economic empowerment and innovation [5, 6].

11. **Incorporate Intersectionality:** Ensure AA and DEI programs address the unique challenges faced by individuals with intersecting identities, such as Black women and individuals with disabilities [4].

12. **Highlight Grassroots Efforts:** Include examples of community-led initiatives, such as Black-led nonprofits, to showcase the role of grassroots movements in advancing equity [5].

13. **Introduce Global Comparisons:** Briefly compare U.S. programs with international efforts, such as South Africa's BEE policies and Canada's equity-focused hiring practices, to provide broader insights [4, 9].

14. **Expand Resistance Strategies:** Develop actionable strategies to counter opposition, such as fostering inclusive leadership, using data to demonstrate benefits, and launching public education campaigns [3, 9, 10].

15. **Define Success Metrics:** Provide concrete examples of metrics, such as increases in Black leadership representation, economic mobility, and wage gap reductions, to measure the effectiveness of AA and DEI programs [5, 6].

16. **Outline Future Research:** Include a section on future research directions, such as the long-term economic impacts of AA and DEI programs and the role of technology in advancing inclusivity [6, 7].

17. **Balance Sector Examples:** Incorporate more examples from public institutions and nonprofits, such as the Dallas Independent School District's equity initiative, to balance the focus on corporate efforts [4].

18. **Expand Economic Opportunities:** Include targeted programs for Black entrepreneurs and businesses, such as grants, mentorship, and access to capital.

19. **Tailor Sector-Specific Strategies:** Provide detailed examples for healthcare, education, and business sectors, emphasizing culturally competent care, teacher diversity, and supplier diversity programs.

20. **Address Educational Disparities:** Highlight initiatives that close achievement gaps for Black students, such as scholarships for HBCUs and tutoring programs.

21. **Combat Resistance with Case Studies:** Incorporate examples of organizations that successfully overcame opposition to AA and DEI programs using data and storytelling.

22. **Promote Public Education Campaigns:** Develop campaigns that showcase the societal benefits of diversity through real-life stories and data-driven arguments.

23. **Engage Communities:** Foster trust and understanding by involving local communities in conversations about AA and DEI programs.

Future Research Directions

1. **Long-Term Economic Impacts:** Investigate the sustained economic benefits of AA and DEI programs for Black communities, including generational wealth creation and community development.

2. **Role of Technology:** Explore how emerging technologies, such as AI and data analytics, can enhance the implementation and monitoring of AA and DEI initiatives.

3. **Intersectionality in Practice:** Conduct studies on the effectiveness of intersectional approaches in addressing compounded discrimination faced by Black women, LGBTQ+ individuals, and those with disabilities.

4. **Global Comparisons:** Examine the outcomes of similar programs in other countries, such as South Africa's BEE policies and Canada's equity-focused hiring practices, to identify transferable strategies.

5. **Resistance Analysis:** Research the root causes of opposition to AA and DEI programs and develop evidence-based strategies to counter resistance effectively.

6. **Sector-Specific Innovations:** Study the impact of AA and DEI programs in underexplored sectors, such as healthcare, STEMM, and the arts, to identify best practices and scalable solutions.

Conclusion

Affirmative Action (AA) and Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) programs are indispensable for addressing systemic inequities and empowering the Black community. By adopting targeted, data-driven strategies and reassessing success metrics, these initiatives can achieve their full potential. Policymakers, educators, and business leaders must collaborate to create inclusive environments where diversity drives innovation and societal progress. With sustained commitment and ongoing innovation, AA and DEI programs can pave the way for a more equitable and prosperous society.

Competing Interests: The author declares that he has no competing interests.

References

1. Rose, D. (2019). Policy feedback and the racialization of affirmative action, 1961-1980. *International Journal of Public Administration, 44*(1), 3–13. https://doi.org/10.1080/01900692.2019.1668411

2. Kamalumpundi, V., Neikirk, K., Kamin Mukaz, D., Vue, Z., Vue, N., Perales, S., & Hinton, A. (2024). Diversity, equity, and inclusion in a polarized world: Navigating challenges and opportunities in STEMM. *Molbiolcell.Org, 35*(11). https://doi.org/10.1091/mbc.E24-06-0264

3. Urofsky, M. I. (2020). The affirmative action puzzle: A living history from Reconstruction to today. In *books.google.com* (pp. 9, 20, 44, 252). Publisher. https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=kIiVDwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR9&dq=affirmative+action+black+community+empowerment+historical+discrimination&ots=tGWXvP8j-7&sig=om7wc_sFcU0UUTREGtLUidPjqqU

4. April, K., Dharani, B., & April, A. (2023). Affirmative action and empowerment. In *Lived Experiences of Exclusion in the Workplace: Psychological & Behavioural Effects* (pp. 155–168). Emerald Publishing Limited. https://doi.org/10.1108/s2051-233320230000007006

5. Moore-Dunson, N. C. (2023). Exploring the Impact of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion on Black Nonprofits: Conversations with Black Arts and Culture Organizations in Cleveland, Ohio. *Rave. Ohiolink.Edu*, 176 p. https://rave.ohiolink.edu/etdc/view?acc_num=akron169039749926486

6. Rosa, J. M. (2025). The Critical Importance of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) and the Detrimental Impact of Anti-DEI Policies. *Researchgate.Net.* https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Jose-Rosa-32/publication/388819858_The_Critical_Importance_of_Diversity_Equity_and_Inclusion_DEI_and_the_Detrimental_Impact_of_Anti-DEI_Policies/links/68360aaebe1b507dce92222e/The-Critical-Importance-of-Diversity-Equity-and-Inclusion-DEI-and-the-Detrimental-Impact-of-Anti-DEI-Policies.pdf

7. McCluney, C. L., King, D. D., Bryant, C. M., & Ali, A. A. (2021). From "Calling in Black" to "Calling for Antiracism Resources": The need for systemic resources to address systemic racism. *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion, 40*(1), 49–59. https://doi.org/10.1108/EDI-07-2020-0180

8. McDonnaugh, E. (2022). The Limits of Equality: A People's History of Affirmative Action. *Harvard Law & Policy Review, 17*, 44–73. https://heinonline.org/hol-cgi-bin/get_pdf.cgi?handle=hein.journals/harlpolrv17&section=7

9. April, K. (2021). The new diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) realities and challenges. In *academia.edu*. academia.edu. https://www.academia.edu/download/75365705/BOOK_CHAPTER_The_New_DEI_Realities_and_Challenges_Kurt_April_2022.pdf

10. Kahlenberg, R. D. (2025). *A Way out of the DEI Wars*. ERIC; ERIC. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED672860